

CEPF Final Project Completion Report

Organization Legal Name:	Wildlife Conservation Society
Project Title:	Indonesia Wildlife Crimes Unit: Dismantling Wildlife Trade Networks in Wallacea
Grant Number:	65724
CEPF Region:	Wallacea
Strategic Direction:	1 Address threats to high priority species
Grant Amount:	\$239,260.00
Project Dates:	November 01, 2015 - September 30, 2018
Date of Report:	November 30, 2018

Implementation Partners

List each partner and explain how they were involved in the project

As attached in the file named: Summary Questions

Conservation Impacts

Summarize the overall impact of your project, describing how your project has contributed to the implementation of the CEPF ecosystem profile

As attached in the file named: Summary Questions

Planned Long-term Impacts - 3+ years (as stated in the approved proposal)

Impact Description	Impact Summary
The long-term objective is the protection of 25 CEPF priority species in Indonesia through a significant reduction in wildlife trade across Wallacea.	In July 2018, MoEF issued the update of protected species list through Ministerial Regulation No. 20/2018 which later was revised by Ministerial Regulation No. 92/2018 in September 2018. In the revised list, out of 25 CEPF priority species, 16 species are included in the revised list which 3 of them are new uplisted species (White Cockatoo (<i>Cacatua alba</i>), Chattering Lory (<i>Lorius garrulus</i>) and Rote Island Snake-necked Turtle (<i>Chelodina mccordi</i>). For the sharks and rays' species,

	are not included in the revised list because have been protected under the MMAF Ministerial Regulations. These legal frameworks will be the umbrella for the protection of these species in the future.
--	---

Planned Short-term Impacts - 1 to 3 years (as stated in the approved proposal)

Impact Description	Impact Summary
1. The dismantling of trafficking and trade networks for 25 CEPF priority species throughout Wallacea, focusing on North Sulawesi and Nusa Tenggara Timur, through training at least 30 law enforcement personnel and undertaking at least 20 prosecutions of wildlife traders.	117 law enforcement personnel trained, 35 prosecutions, where 46 criminals were sentenced/fined, with the 20 cases ongoing
2. The reform of the Indonesian protected species list to include the CEPF priority species.	In July 2018, MoEF issued the update of protected species list through Ministerial Regulation No. 20/2018 which later was revised by Ministerial Regulation No. 92/2018 in September 2018.


Describe the success or challenges of the project toward achieving its short-term and long-term impact objectives

The project has succeeded in achieving its short-term and long term-impacts. The project has contributed to supporting a regulatory reform process with MoEF and LIPI, as well as MMAF, through a series of discussions. This has led to the revision of the protected species list which has not hitherto been updated for 20 years. The revised list was enacted by Ministerial Regulation No. 92/2018 which consists of 914 species with 237 new species including 3 CEPF priority species (White Cockatoo (*Cacatua alba*), Chattering Lory (*Lorius garrulus*) and Rote Island Snake-necked Turtle (*Chelodina mccordi*). With these revisions, those species will be fully protected.

The project provided many benefits to various law enforcement agencies and communities to protect both terrestrial and marine species in the Wallacea region. Firstly, the field officers have more knowledge about protected marine and terrestrial species. They work on a daily basis with the WCU to inspect the bushmeat market, bird traders, and identify the species from their arrest. They learned from their patrols, investigations, and arrests of the suspects' activities, which is more effective rather than conducting classroom trainings. At the same time, the officers (who have no conservation background) also learned about why the species must be protected and of the various regulations to protect species.

Secondly, an effective law enforcement collaboration was created in North Sulawesi and East Nusa Tenggara. The taskforce in Bitung succeed to handle various wildlife cases, and the marine patrol in East Nusa Tenggara succeeded in increasing the commitment and collaboration between marine police, district marine and fisheries office, and NGOs. The strong collaboration in North Sulawesi and East Nusa Tenggara succeeded in arresting traffickers, rescued protected marine species safely, rehabilitating and releasing confiscated protected bird species back into the wild.

Thirdly, the authorities now have improved knowledge about species conservation and are more confident to use their knowledge. Their knowledge benefits them to explain the species protection to the community during marine patrols, highway patrols, market inspections and during community meetings.



Fourthly, community participation was increased in tackling IWT. Communities gave information of poaching or trafficking incidents to the authorities for follow up. The project succeeded to reverse community antipathy about the slow response of the authorities when they found and reported wildlife crime. The community in East Nusa Tenggara is now very active in reporting by-catch incidents to the authorities, as well as poaching and trafficking of protected marine and terrestrial species in North Sulawesi and Maluku. Community participation was also increased by establishing and maintaining Pokmaswas (community informant) in East Nusa Tenggara. The Pokmaswas actively conducts field inspection and monitoring, supporting intelligence information to local authorities.

Were there any unexpected impacts (positive or negative)?

The revision of the protected species list was started in the beginning of the project in 2015, with co-funding by other projects. MOEF enacted the revised list in July 2018 through Ministerial Regulation No. 20/2018. After this enactment, there was strong opposition from a group called “kicau mania”, also known as the song bird lover. According to them, the new P20 will threaten livelihoods as the revisions include song birds that are commonly traded by communities. The protest led to the review of the new regulation and its subsequent revision through Ministerial Regulation No. 92/2018 which removed 5 song bird species from the protected species list.

No negative impact from this project. However, the Wallacea region remains very important, attracting donor and partners to invest their resources to conserve wildlife and habitat. Having good coordination among the donors and partners will reduce redundancy and unnecessary overlap or different approaches in the same location, such as law enforcement actions.

Project Components and Products/Deliverables

Describe the results from each product/deliverable:

Component		Deliverable		
#	Description	#	Description	Results for Deliverable
1	Support Indonesian CITES management authorities to update protected species lists	1.1	Reports from Focus Group Discussions and public consultations, including the names of attendees and minutes of the discussions.	<p>During the project (2015 – 2018), with co-funding from other donors, 4 discussions were conducted with MoEF, LIPI and MMAF. The 1st FGD was conducted on October 9th, 2015 with 29 participants from MoEF, MMAF and LIPI. The 2nd FGD was conducted on February 2nd, 2016 with a total of 31 participants from MoEF, MMAF, LIPI and NGOs.</p> <p>In 2016, the proposed list was finalized by LIPI. Then organized by LIPI and co-funded by another donor, on 24 February 2017 and March 2017, the follow up meeting to finalize the proposed list and the ministerial regulation were held. The total participants for each meeting was 35 participants (LIPI, MOEF and WCS) and 45 participants (LIPI, MOEF, MMAF, NGOs, IPB, WCS).</p> <p>The public consultation was completed on 10th December, with 59 participants from MoEF, LIPI, Universities, Associations and NGOs.</p>
1	Support Indonesian CITES management authorities to update protected species lists	1.2	Draft revised protected species list, which is endorsed by the key government agencies (especially MoEF and LIPI).	<p>Final draft of protected species was submitted by LIPI to MOEF on April 29th, 2017, to be signed by the Minister and to be enacted with Ministerial Regulation.</p> <p>In the final draft of protected species list there 889 species are listed and there are 3 CEPF priority species are included namely: White Cockatoo (<i>Cacatua alba</i>); Chattering Lory (<i>Lorius garrulus</i>) and Rote Island Snake-necked Turtle (<i>Chelodina mccordi</i>).</p> <p>The revised list was enacted through Ministerial Regulation on July, 2018 as revised by Ministerial Regulation No. 92/2018 which include 914 species listed as protected including 16 CEPF priority species and 3 of them are new species namely: White Cockatoo (<i>Cacatua alba</i>); Chattering Lory (<i>Lorius garrulus</i>) and Rote Island Snake-necked Turtle (<i>Chelodina mccordi</i>).</p>
2	Dismantle trade networks for priority species	2.1	Report on training of at least 30 law enforcement personnel in law enforcement	<p>The WCU provided four trainings to a total of 117 law enforcement personnel that includes prosecutors and investigators, including from other NGO projects (CEPF grantees). We continue to monitor the performances of the trainees in handling cases that are related to illegal wildlife trade (IWT). This includes monitoring the prosecutions given by the trainee in IWT cases. WCU</p>

			approaches or SMART	training team provides the trainees with different subjects such as basic investigation techniques, modus operandi, trade route, species identification, law enforcement action to mitigate illegal wildlife trade.
2	Dismantle trade networks for priority species	2.2	An established Wildlife Crime Unit (WCU) in Wallacea that is fully functional with strong government relationships, catalyzing action on illegal wildlife trafficking.	The WCU established a local informant network in Wallacea. This led to a strong relationship with the government to mitigate wildlife trafficking. From the beginning to the end of the project, this collaboration resulted in the handling of 57 cases, where the WCU supported the government in data and information collection in Wallacea and Java-Bali regions that led to 64 sting operations and legal assistance to ensure that IWT cases are solved. WCU supported the law enforcement personnel such as the police, forest police, customs, BKSDA, and prosecutors with data and information collection, sting operation, and legal assistance to apprehend wildlife poachers, traffickers, and traders.
2	Dismantle trade networks for priority species	2.3	Documentation of at least 30 wildlife trade cases investigated (10 per year), securing at least 20 prosecutions.	The WCU supported Indonesian law enforcement agencies to handle 57 cases from November 2015 to September 2018. Out of all the cases, there were 35 prosecutions, from which 46 criminals were sentenced/fined. Meanwhile the preparation for 20 cases is ongoing. The highest sentence was given to a shark fin smuggler, who was penalized to serve time in prison for 2 years and was fined USD7600.
2	Dismantle trade networks for priority species	2.4	At least 30 media articles or programs highlighting the Indonesian government response to combat trade in CEPF priority species across Wallacea (10 per year)	During the project, there were 556 media articles highlighting the Indonesian government response to combat trade in CEPF priority species across Wallacea has been published. The number consists of 81 publications in 2016, 278 publications in 2017, and 197 publications in 2018. The media articles were released in international media (108 pieces), national media (293 pieces), and local media (155 pieces). Some of the well-known media publications were BBC news, CNN Indonesia, National Geographic, Mongabay, The Guardian, The Telegraph, The Jakarta Post, Liputan6, NetTV, RRI, Tempo, and Kompas.
2	Dismantle trade networks for priority species	2.5	Updated information on the extent of trade in CEPF priority	The trade routes and volumes of CEPF priority species in Wallacea has been mapped and expanded, including the national and international routes. The updated information on the trade, including the trade route map is provided in the report (as attached).

			species in Wallacea, focusing on north Sulawesi and Nusa Tenggara Timur, including trade routes and volumes.	
--	--	--	--	--

Please describe and submit any tools, products, or methodologies that resulted from this project or contributed to the results.

WCS's WCU used SMART marine patrol tools to ensure the effectiveness of marine patrols to protect manta rays, whale sharks, and dugong in East Nusa Tenggara. The approach is very effective to target the key sites from poaching, reducing the poaching of manta >90% within 2 years. This tool will be used as a pilot project for the protection of other marine species, especially in North Sulawesi and North Maluku.

The revised list and P92/2018 is attached.

Lessons Learned

Describe any lessons learned during the design and implementation of the project, as well as any related to organizational development and capacity building.

Consider lessons that would inform:

- Project Design Process (*aspects of the project design that contributed to its success/shortcomings*)
- Project Implementation (*aspects of the project execution that contributed to its success/shortcomings*)
- Describe any other lessons learned relevant to the conservation community

During the project, a significant achievement was made with the policy reform with contribution from the project and also the strong partnership with government agencies and CSOs. We have learned that to conduct policy-relevant activities that directly contribute to policy changes, it is critically important to build a strong partnership and maintain intensive communication with the partner through formal and informal approaches.

This project opens the opportunity to strengthen a collaboration with the Attorney General's Office (AGO). The previous prosecutor training in Manado resulted a strong commitment from the AGO to handle IWT cases, as well as their request to train more prosecutors in the Wallacea region. A high number of requests from MoEF, local government, and the police in Wallacea demonstrated the crucial need of specific training such as species identification, investigative techniques, understanding

the modus operandi, how to handle wildlife case (completing legal document), and how to do a better coordination among key stakeholders.

Sustainability / Replication

Summarize the success or challenges in ensuring the project will be sustained or replicated, including any unplanned activities that are likely to result in increased sustainability or replicability.

In the context of the policy changes, maintaining interest from key partner is critically important while facing with restructure of within internal government itself. One of the challenges for the policy reform such as the revision of protected species list was the after the regulation had been enacted. The government has to communicate with the public the pros and cons of the regulation. WCS successfully supported the Government of Indonesia in revising one of the most important regulations on wildlife conservation and this showed the Government's commitment to protect their species and halt illegal wildlife trade. However, the enactment has yet to be accompanied with a solid and well-prepared socialization and communication plan for the public and this resulted in the revision of the enacted regulation two months later. We will continue to maintain strong partnership with the key government agencies and CSOs to ensure the best implementation of the enacted regulation and also to support the government in having regular review of the regulation

Safeguards

If not listed as a separate Project Component and described above, summarize the implementation of any required action related to social, environmental, or pest management safeguards

Additional Comments/Recommendations

Use this space to provide any further comments or recommendations in relation to your project or CEPF

To make sure the sustainability of the achievements will be handed over to the government, there remains a need to continue the project because it is still relevant. Two years project is enough to identify the problems and challenges, as well as deliver some good achievements. However, project extension is also needed to maintain the achievements and to fully transfer the skill and knowledge from NGOs to the authorities.

Additional Funding

Provide details of any additional funding that supported this project and any funding secured for the project, organization, or the region, as a result of CEPF investment

Total additional funding (US\$)
\$82,577.00

Type of funding

Please provide a breakdown of additional funding (counterpart funding and in-kind) by source, categorizing each contribution into one of the following categories:

- A Project Co-Financing (other donors or your organization contribute to the direct costs of this project)*
- B Grantee and Partner Leveraging (other donors contribute to your organization or a partner organization as a direct result of successes with this CEPF funded project)*
- C Regional/Portfolio Leveraging (other donors make large investments in a region because of CEPF investment or successes related to this project)*

UK Department: \$60,000 (Categories A)

PRIVAT: \$3,742.17 (Categories A)

US Federal: \$18,834.83 (Categories A)

Information Sharing and CEPF Policy

CEPF is committed to transparent operations and to helping civil society groups share experiences, lessons learned, and results. Final project completion reports are made available on our Web site, www.cepf.net, and publicized in our newsletter and other communications.

1. Please include your full contact details (Name, Organization, Mailing address, Telephone number, E-mail address) below

Hanifah Siregar, Wildlife Conservation Society - Indonesia Program, Jl. Tampomas No. 35, Babakan, Bogor Tengah, Kota Bogor, Jawa Barat, 16151, Indonesia, +62251-8306029, hsiregar@wcs.org