

## **Safeguard Policies: Process Framework**

CEPF Large Grant Project

**Project title:** Implementing the Hellshire Hills and Portland Ridge Sub-areas Management Plans in Jamaica

**Application Code:** 64193

**Implemented by:** Caribbean Coastal Area Management Foundation

**Project Manager:** Ingrid Parchment, Executive Director

### **1. Background to Project**

This project is designed to implement management plans to conserve two high priority KBAs in Jamaica - Hellshire Hills (11,400 ha), and Portland Ridge and Bight KBA (4,200 ha) and the more than 20 globally threatened species that depend on them. These areas are legally protected as part of the Portland Bight Protected Area (PBPA) - a multiple use protected area (approximating to IUCN category VI). With a total area of 51,975 ha, the Portland Bight Protected Area (PBPA) recognizes the interdependence of terrestrial, wetland and marine areas and the anthropogenic lands surrounding them. The management plans were developed under a previous CEPF project "Management Planning in the Hellshire Hills and Portland Ridge and Bight Key Biodiversity Areas of Jamaica" (Project/GEM code: 59913).

The management plans for the two target KBAs were developed within the broader framework of the management plan for the PBPA/Conservation Corridor. The Portland Bight Protected Area/Conservation Corridor is a multiple use protected area that includes several small towns, cane fields, farms, housing estates, ports, fishing beaches and power stations as well as wetlands, forests, beaches, coral reefs, sea grass beds and cays. The objective of the protected area is to integrate sustainable development with environmental conservation to the mutual benefit of all. This includes developing sustainable livelihoods, as well as prohibiting illegal activities in selected areas of high importance for biodiversity.

#### **1.1 *Strategies and summary actions***

This project is built around the following programmatic strategies and supporting actions:

- a. Supporting co-management of the KBAs and sustainable forest use. This includes establishing an effective framework for the management of the PBPA (including the KBAs) at the national level through a management council, and at the grass-roots level through councils of forest users. This will ensure that the available resources

are used effectively and give the forest users the opportunity play an active role in management of the KBAs.

- b. Improving development planning by channelling information about biodiversity conservation, sustainable development and climate change adaptation into ongoing development and planning processes for the PBPA. An important action of this strategy is preparing an assessment of development options for a proposed transshipment port that could put important sections of the Hellshire Hills KBA in jeopardy. This is being done through a sub-grant to the Conservation Strategy Fund.
- c. Adopting measures for ex situ conservation of threatened plants to lay the ground work for reforestation of the Portland Ridge KBA and for threatened plant species conservation through a nursery and testing a new concept of community conservation gardens.
- d. Strengthening enforcement coordination and monitoring of environmentally unsound practices by improving collaboration between agencies and organizations with an enforcement mandate in the area and increasing the numbers of community monitors and Honorary Game Wardens (HGWs).
- e. Assessing the feasibility of supporting sustainable livelihoods through Conservation Agreements in the Hellshire Hills KBA.

The project also includes institutional development strategies around fundraising and building C-CAM's capacity.

## **1.2 Safeguard triggers**

This project triggers the following CEPF safeguards:

- *Environmental assessment through the construction of a plant nursery to support the ex situ conservation of threatened plants.* An Environmental Impact Assessment and Environmental Management Plan has been prepared as a separate document to ensure there are minimal negative environmental impacts and to assure the health and safety of workers during construction and operation.
- *Socioeconomic impacts through involuntary restriction due to improvements to on-the-ground enforcement within legally designated protected areas by relevant agencies.* This process framework below explains how negative impacts on livelihoods will be mitigated through this project.

## **2. Project Activities and Potential Impacts to Local Livelihoods through Involuntary Restrictions**

### ***2.1 Nature of involuntary restrictions***

As part of an overall approach to improvement management of the KBAs, this project seeks to bring about better enforcement through improving coordination among existing enforcement agencies and their officers and by increasing community involvement in enforcement (HGWs and community monitors).

Improvements will relate to existing enforcement of involuntary restrictions of access to resources within the Hellshire Hills that are currently protected under law.

- The Forest Act (1996) prohibits the harvesting and removal of trees from forest reserves without a permit. It also makes it an offence to enter a forest reserve with a machete or a dog.
- The Urban Development Corporation (UDC) designated lands (including the Hellshire Hills Forest Reserve and the Goat Islands) are also owned by the UDC. Unauthorised entry into these lands is treated as trespass. UDC employs rangers to prevent trespassers (including charcoal burners) entering their property.
- The Wild Life Protection Act (1991) prohibits “the possession of the whole or any part, living or dead” of protected animals and birds (sic), hunting of gamebirds outside the a declared hunting season and all hunting of gamebirds in forest reserves and game reserves.
- The management plan recommended zoning, to be developed through a participatory process and put into effect through new regulations to be developed under the Natural Resources Conservation Act. These regulations are yet to be developed and will not be enacted before the end of the project.

No new or additional restrictions will be introduced by the project. There will be no change in the extent or nature of protection of the KBAs.

### ***2.2 Summary profile of existing unsustainable or illegal users to be affected***

Improvements to enforcement could potentially reduce access to forest reserves, including wetlands, by about 200 persons who are engaged full or part-time in the following illegal or unpermitted activities in the forests and wetlands:

- Charcoal burners – initial studies suggest that they are most active on the periphery of the hills, although a few are penetrating deep into the forest. The majority enter the forests from the Hill Run side. Some also come by boat from the Manatee Bay coast. Some use the forests year round, for others charcoal burning is a secondary

occupation, which they do when their main occupation is unavailable (e.g. fishing, seasonal work in the cane fields).

- Fuel wood harvesters – These people are most active on the eastern boundary near Hellshire beach, where they collect fuel for the restaurants and cookshops on the beach, whose clients prefer food cooked on an open fire.
- Pot stick harvesters – A few persons enter the forests to cut thin sticks that will be used by the fishers to make their fishing pots. There is no information about how many people do this or where they operate.
- Wild pig hunters – Pig hunters operate mainly from Hill Run and western Hellshire. Pigs are an invasive species so their activities would be welcome, except that they generally hunt with dogs, which are a threat to the iguanas.
- Illegal bird hunters – game bird (columbid) hunting is a middle class sport and is not carried out for subsistence or as an income-generating activity. Illegal activities include hunting without a licence, hunting out of season, shooting protected birds and hunting in a game reserve or forest reserve.

Our interviews with forest users have indicated that only a very small minority of people operate in the remote and very inaccessible core areas of the Hellshire Hills. An unknown but very small proportion (probably fewer than 10 persons) of the estimated 200 persons who use the forests are currently involved in unsustainable and illegal activities. The improvements in enforcement that will occur as a result of this project will come into force gradually, as the project is not increasing the number of enforcement officers who will be operating in the core. Improvements in forest conservation are expected to be achieved through voluntary compliance rather than forced relocation. A few people may be affected by improved enforcement of existing regulations and restrictions and will have to relocate their activities from the core forests on UDC lands to other areas to which they have legal access.

### **2.3 Project activities**

The project will include the following specific actions towards improved enforcement:

- **Establishment of an enforcement working group** that includes managers and supervisors of enforcement staff from agencies with responsibility for enforcement in the KBAs (NEPA, Forestry Department, UDC, police, Jamaica Defence Force Coastguard, Honorary C-CAM Game Wardens) that meets annually to establish monitoring and enforcement priorities and procedures.
- **Enhancement of community monitoring** through the gazetting of five additional Volunteer Honorary Game Wardens (HGWs) under the Wild Life Protection Act and the appointment of five community monitors appointed by C-CAM. Honorary Game

Gardens and community monitors will be trained and will operate within the framework of a community monitoring programme.

- ***Improvements to communication through the development of a networking tool***, such as a Google group, that staff of enforcement agencies and community monitors can use to network and facilitate rapid sharing of information about incidents and approaches to enhance enforcement efforts.

The desired net effect of these interventions funded through the CEPF project is increased efficiency and effectiveness of existing enforcement mechanisms. It is also expected that enforcement will be less important as education and awareness raising will increase compliance.

Increased community monitoring will support the efforts of agencies, but these individuals have no prosecutorial powers and their role will not be limited to supporting enforcement, but importantly, they will also help monitor the state and condition of the resource.

Improvements to coordination and networking among enforcement partners will be supplemented by project activities to build public awareness and knowledge of the laws, the importance of biodiversity and alternatives to unsustainable practises.

### **3. Measures to mitigate impacts on affected persons**

The project will take the measures listed below to mitigate negative impacts on those users whose current livelihoods strategies will be compromised by more efficient and effective enforcement of existing laws and regulations.

The project approach is rooted in participatory processes aimed at ensuring that those who stand to lose livelihoods will have a say in determining suitable, sustainable alternatives that are compatible with the effective management of the resource. C-CAM acknowledges that many of these persons are among the most vulnerable stakeholders, hence the project includes a deliberate strategy to “give voice” to these people through user-led groups whose perspectives inform management of the area.

- ***Register of charcoal producers, pot stick harvested etc who currently operate in the core area of the Hellshire Hills KBA***: As part of the mobilization efforts towards creating user councils and the detailed socio-economic assessment in support of the conservation agreements (see below), people who currently earn all or part of their livelihoods from activities that encroach on the Forest Reserve on a regular (including seasonally regular) basis will be identified.

- **Formation of user councils:** Using the Portland Bight Fisheries Management Council as a model, C-CAM will engage and strengthen user groups and CBOs and then bring representatives together to make recommendations for resource management. The Portland Bight Tourism Council has already been started. New groups will include a Forest Council and an Industrial Council. The user councils will be the primary mechanism for direct community and user-group representation on the management council for the protected area.

The Forest User Council will facilitate the organisation of forest users into groups that will allow them to better articulate their needs and participate in addressing the problems they face. The Forest User Council will also be an important vehicle for stakeholder-driven identification of viable, desirable, alternative livelihoods. A short-coming of previous enforcement efforts has been the lack of engagement of stakeholders in identifying viable solutions.

- **Conservation Agreements:** The project will assess the feasibility of using Conservation Agreements to redirect forest users in the Hellshire Hills KBA into sustainable activities. This will include a more comprehensive socio-economic assessment and listing of forest users, meetings with forest users and drafting of agreements with potential partners who can provide funding and support.
- 
- **Enforcement working group:** C-CAM will work with and through the Enforcement Working Group to develop a feasible slate of acceptable mechanisms for phasing out illegal use of the resource by those who habitually use it as part of their livelihood strategies. The existence of a list or register will guard against new entrants attempting to establish themselves in the area after the project has started in efforts to benefit from any phase-out support that may be offered. Potential mechanisms include relocation and transitioning to alternative livelihoods with support for training offered through complementary programmes offered by groups such as the All Island Bee Farmers Association, the Social Development Commission, and the Small Business Development Association.

#### 4. Participatory implementation

Participatory implementation is an integral element of the project strategy for minimising negative impacts of improved KBA management, including enforcement, on stakeholders and user groups and for ensuring that they support project actions. C-CAM has consistently applied participatory processes in developing management plans for the area, and will continue to do so as it focuses on implementation. Co-management is fundamental to C-CAM's approach. C-CAM has involved stakeholders including resource users in the design of

the PBPA, the Special Fisheries Conservation Areas (SFCAs) and the proposed Biosphere Reserve. It has also engaged stakeholders in the development and review of the management plans prepared by C-CAM under CEPF Grant #59913, which set the stage for this project.

As previously explained in 3 above, the user councils will be the primary mechanism for direct community and user-group representation on the PBPA management council for the protected area. General community consultations will be handled through the Parish Development Committees<sup>1</sup>. These groups will participate in the C-CAM projects committee, and will be engaged in review of plans and programmes for the project area.

The projected schedule of management council meetings is once per quarter.

The role of the Community Development Officers will be to liaise with the communities and stakeholders, supporting the community monitoring programme, the Conservation Gardens, Conservation Agreements and other on-the-ground activities. They will carry out education programmes in schools and with youth groups, parish councils, PDCs and Development Area Councils. They will also meet with people in informal settings in order to gather and share information related to conservation of natural resources, biodiversity and sustainable development. They will interact with the enforcement team. They will be ideally placed to ensure that there are no grievances as a result of project activities, and to make people aware that there are procedures in place to ensure that they are not disadvantaged as a result of the project.

Appendix 1 outlines the specific log frame activities that will involve communities and resource user groups and explains the participatory mechanisms and fora that will be used for engagement. (The numbering of the activities corresponds to the numbering in the logical frame work and only relevant activities are presented here.)

## **5. The grievance redress mechanism**

The grievance process will be addressed as follows:

- a. The public education and consultation mechanisms will include clear instructions about how people should proceed if they have a grievance or question about the project and its implementation. This includes information about who is in charge of

---

<sup>1</sup> PBPA management council is the overall stakeholder council to manage the protected area, the Parish Development Committee is part of a governance structure that looks at supports citizens' participation in parish wide development issues and the C-CAM Project Committee monitors project implementation by the organization.

the overall project and their contact information including C-CAM, CEPF and CANARI.

- b. People will be advised in the first instance to raise their concerns at a project meeting or to contact the project manager, to arrange a meeting to discuss their issues.
- c. If this does not address the issue, they should submit their complaint in writing by hand, post, email, fax or courier to C-CAM's office in Lionel Town.
- d. Complaints will be assessed by the project staff and routed to the appropriate agency. Copies of all grievances will be sent immediately to CANARI and the CEPF - Secretariat in Arlington, Virginia.
- e. Based on their advice from CEPF, appropriate steps will be taken.
- f. Information about the grievance procedure will be made available to the public through leaflets and announcements at the relevant meetings. This information will include the contact details for C-CAM, CEPF and CANARI.



## Appendix 1

**Table 1: Project activities and safeguard implications**

Activity	Community Involvement In Process
Project component 1: HH and PR KBAs are managed through participatory co-management agreements, committees and councils at the national, local and community levels.	
1.1 Agreements to manage the PBPA negotiated and signed with at least 4 major stakeholders (e.g. NEPA, Forestry Department, UDC, Fisheries Division, JNHT and gun clubs) negotiated and signed.	The community members were involved in the protected area planning process which forms the basis for these agreements. It is not appropriate for them to be further involved in the signing of agreements between C-CAM and government agencies.
1.3 PBPA management committee established and meeting quarterly.	Communities will have representation on management committee. The number of representatives and criteria for committee membership will be determined by the agencies in consultation with the communities as part of the project.
1.4 Operations plans for the Hellshire Hills and Portland Ridge KBAs are developed collaboratively for 2015.	Input provided from the user councils that will developed under this project.
1.5 Forest users listed in HH and PR.	Community members will be asked to suggest names at workshops, meetings and discussions.
1.6 Outreach to forest users started by Community Development Officers (4 days/month in each area x 15 mo).	Forest users will be identified, and invited to participate in process at various formal and informal meetings as well as through face to face and personal approaches by Community Development Offices, who will go to places in the communities where the users congregate. The process is expected to be an on-going one, continuing

Activity	Community Involvement In Process
	throughout the project, because forest use is known to be both seasonal and opportunistic.
1.7 Workshops for forest users held - one in each area - to get consensus on user councils	Forest users will have the opportunity to comment on formulating the councils.
1.8 Educational programme for forest users developed and implemented.	Forest users will be made more aware of importance of forest conservation, alternatives and practical solutions.
1.9 Forest councils established (including draft TOR and interim management committee)	. Forest users will be fully engaged through this process.
<b>Project component 2: Biodiversity conservation and climate change priorities are influencing government planning and decision-making for the Hellshire Hills and Portland Ridge KBAs.</b>	
2.1 C-CAM provides information to support LSDP process and participates in LSDP stakeholder consultations in 3 Development Areas (Clarendon, St. Catherine and Portmore).	This process includes community consultations.
2.2 Community EIA training workshops held for Hellshire Hills and Portland Ridge	This is a community-based activity
<b>Project component 3: The long term financial sustainability of the management of Hellshire Hills and Portland Ridge KBAs is enhanced by the implementation of the fundraising plan and business plans and project development.</b>	
3.1 PBPA fund raising campaign developed and operationalised.	Consideration will be given to how community members can contribute to fund-raising efforts
3.5 National and international donor listings developed.	Community members will be engaged in the process of identifying donors.
3.6 Outreach to Diaspora started through attendance in national annual Diaspora meeting.	Community members will be engaged in the process of identifying contacts within Diaspora groups.

Activity	Community Involvement In Process
3.7 Business plan for PBPA developed (with funding from GEF).	Meetings will be held with selected community members to get their suggestions and comments.
3.9 One fund-raising event held.	Community members will be involved in assisting with event (e.g. contributing services, participating in event)
3.10 Website content updated, comprehensive and attractive to donors. Social media updated. Website includes button so that visitors can make online donations.	Design will take community members and their access to media into account.
<b>Project component 4: Reduced threats to biodiversity including trigger species achieved through enhanced law enforcement and better coordination of enforcement efforts, community monitoring and increased environmental education and outreach.</b>	
4.6 Identify and train 5 additional HGWs.	These will be community members.
4.1, 4.2 Establish HH/PR 4.4 Enforcement Working Group and hold annual coordination workshop	Community-based HGWs will be involved.
4.4 Networking tool to support enforcement e.g. Google group set up and shared with all enforcement team members.	This will be accessible to HGWs who have internet access.
4.9 Five Additional community monitors are appointed.	These will be community members.
4.5 One training workshop (2 days) held for whole enforcement team.	Community-based HGWs will be involved.
4.10 Community Monitors' Manual updated, printed and circulated	This is designed for use by community members.
4.9 Two Training workshops held for community monitors and HGWs.	These will be community members.
4.10 Community Development Officers develop and supervise community monitoring and awareness programmes.	Community monitors will benefit from training.
4.11 Community EIA training workshop held for Hellshire Hills and Portland Ridge.	Community members will be better able to express their views on the

Activity	Community Involvement In Process
Reports prepared on workshops.	proposed transshipment port and other major projects.
<b>Project component 5: The long-term survival of at least 6 threatened plant species is enhanced through establishment of an ex situ plant conservation nursery (ESPCN) and ex situ plantings.</b>	
5.5 Collect seeds and planting material from threatened plants in Hellshire Hills and Portland Ridge and establish material in nursery.	Locals will be hired to collect planting materials.
5.6 Develop conservation gardens concept, establish 5 demonstration conservation garden, prepare a report evaluating concept.	First conservation gardens will be established near a KBA by a community member, who will benefit from positive publicity.
5.7 Develop educational materials on trigger species (banners, leaflets, PPT) and take them to horticulture shows in Mandeville Clarendon, St. Catherine and Kingston, and national Denbigh Agricultural show.	Community members will receive materials and will be more aware.
<b>Project component 6: Project monitoring and reporting meets CEPF requirements</b>	
6.4 Safeguard process framework developed and implemented.	Safeguards will be in place.
6.5 Complaints procedure developed and implemented.	Community members will be aware of their rights and the procedures (through outreach at user councils and by CDOs)
<b>Component 7: Establish the feasibility of implementing Conservation Agreement in the HHKBA</b>	
7.3 Socio economic field survey completed and report completed	Stakeholder assessment will identify as many forest stakeholders and assess their vulnerabilities.
7.4 Local stakeholder meetings held (east and west Hellshire).	A fully participatory process will ensure engagement of community members and forest users throughout the process.
7.5 Baseline report on legal, policy and	Community issues will be included.

Activity	Community Involvement In Process
economic issues has been compiled (based on HHGI management plan).	
7.6 Theory of change workshop held with experts	Community leaders will participate.
7.11 Draft agreements prepared.	These are expected to address concerns of community members.
<b>Component 8: Develop and implement sub-grant with Conservation Strategy Fund (CSF) for cost-benefit analysis of development options for HHGI</b>	
8.4 Arrange for first field visit by CSF to Jamaica (including meetings with key people in Kingston, agencies and communities, field trip).	As part of the project, CSF personnel will meet and consult with selected community representatives.
8.6 Hold 2 workshops to discuss integrating CSF findings into planning (1 local, 1 national).	One workshop will be for communities in HH area to make them aware of the implications of their findings for the communities.
8.9 Work with JET and PANOS to develop education and awareness campaign re CSF assessment (e.g. social media, local and international press, PPT presentation and written materials).	Outreach to local communities will be an important element of this campaign.